

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY MEN’S BLUES COMMITTEE

Minutes of the Michaelmas Term Closed Meeting held via Zoom at 1900, on 13th of NOVEMBER 2020



Attendance

President: Callum Sullivan (Peterhouse)
 Senior Member: Dr Scott Annett (Robinson)
 Hon. Secretary: Matt Watson (Corpus Christi)

Present:

Callum Sullivan	-	<i>President</i>	-
Dr Scott Annett	-	<i>Senior Member</i>	-
Matt Watson	-	<i>Hon. Secretary</i>	-
James Bernard	Jphb2	CUBC	Vice President
Stephen Leonard	Sjl95	CURUFC	Captain
David Roper	dmr53	CUSRC	Captain
Nick Taylor	nt409	CUCC	Captain
Jonathan Parkes	jjp54	CUHC	Captain
Salil Navapurkar	Sn520	CULTC	Captain
Callum Nicolas	cnn26	CUABC	Captain
Samuel Clarke	Sc2101	CUAC	Captain
Joe Massingham	jtm44	CUH&H	Captain
James Balmie	Jcb223	CUGC	Captain
Jonas Fusaka	jf618	CUBbC	Captain
Alex Lezard	ajl205	CUSWPC	Captain
Alexander Bull	Ahb38	CUAFC	Captain
Lucy Hart	Lah67	CUWBC President	-

Minutes

The Hon. Sec presented to the committee the re-wording of the new status granted for CU Cycling Club at the previous meeting. The status was not written as discussed at the last meeting and was therefore updated by the Hon. Sec and passed by the committee. There were no other comments about the previous meeting’s minutes, which were passed unanimously.

Constitutional Changes

Two constitutional changes were introduced at this meeting.

Firstly, the MBC ratified the changes written by the Hon. Sec into the constitution surrounding the creation of the Honorary Full and Half Blue in light of the COVID-19 pandemic. More details can be found in Section 9 and Appendix V of the MBC Constitution.

Secondly, there was an anomaly noted in the standing rules by the Hon. Sec. In Appendix 1 of the old constitution it was stated that a quorum of eleven members were required to grant a sport Full Blue status. However, in Section 6 it states that a quorum of ten voting members are required on any vote pertaining to Blues. The Hon. Sec discussed this inaccuracy with the Senior Member before the meeting. It was decided that the quorum for granting Full Blues status should be changed to ten voting members, in order to align this with Section 6 of the constitution. The motion was passed unanimously.

Hon. Sec to update and publish the constitution with the specified changes.

Status Applications - Blues

CUDT – Dance Sport

It was brought to the MBC's attention that the recent status granted to CUDT was not particularly robust. This was brought to the attention of the Hon. Sec by the Captain of CUDT. The Hon. Sec presented to the MBC the slight change in the status that CUDT were requesting. This involved changing the old Full Blue status so that the number of competitions the status could be achieved in was stricter. The CUDT Captain said his reason for proposing this was to prevent individuals winning a Full Blue in Dance Sport when they were not worthy of such an award.

Therefore, the MBC was happy to ratify a new status for CUDT as following:

A Full Blue is awarded to an athlete fulfilling the following criteria in the same season:

- 1. Competes in the Varsity Match, AND one of the following:*
- 2. Places in the top 3 couples in either the IVDC advanced division or in the pre-championship division at the Champions of Tomorrow competition, OR*
- 3. Reaches the 2nd round of either the British National Amateur Championship or the British Open Amateur Championship qualifiers (top 36 couples entered into the competition, out of 60)*

A Half Blue is awarded to an athlete fulfilling the following criteria in the same season:

- 1. Competes in the Varsity Match, AND one of the following:*
- 2. Places in the top 9 couples in the Varsity Match, OR*
- 3. Places in the top 6 advanced couples at the Student National Championship*

Hon. Sec to notify CUDT of the outcome.

CUPOLO – Polo

It was noted that CUPOLO were not able to present their status at the Michaelmas Term meeting. Therefore, their application will be discussed at the Lent Term meeting in 2021.

CURFLC – Rugby League

The MBC discussed the application made by CURFLC. The proposed status included all members of the Varsity first team being awarded Full Blues for participation. The reason for this proposal is to align the CURFLC status with the one currently in place at Oxford University. The MBC understood the reasons presented for this by CURFLC and congratulated them on their upwards trajectory of results against Oxford. However, given that CURFLC have not yet proven they are at a standard to grant this status based on participation, both in BUCS and in their Varsity Match results, the application was **rejected**.

It was also noted that the current Full Blue status for CURFLC is currently invalid. Their status allows the top 5 athletes to be awarded Full Blues if the team achieves a top 2 finish in Midlands 1A. However, from the Hon. Sec's research it seems that CURFLC are now competing in a different league (South-East 1) in BUCS. This makes their current status for this year invalid if CURFLC finish in the top 2 teams of this league. The Captain of CURFLC was contacted in the afternoon of the 8th November by email to also provide more information about their application, but no response was received.

It is recommended that CURFLC apply for another status change to update their Full Blue status to the current league they are now competing in.

Therefore, the status for CURFLC remains:

A Full Blue may be awarded to an athlete (maximum of 5 Full Blue awards per academic year) who fulfils the Half Blue criteria AND all of the following criteria in a single academic year:

- 1a) Plays in a winning Varsity Match side OR*
- 1b) Plays in a team that finishes in the top two in the BUCS Midlands 1A league.*

A Half Blue may be awarded to an athlete who fulfils all of the following criteria in a single academic year:

- 1) Plays in the Varsity Match. This includes all 17 players so long as the player takes the pitch for at least one live passage of play.*

Hon. Sec to notify CURFLC of the outcome.

CUBC – Lightweight Rowing

The MBC discussed the application made by CUBC (Lightweight) at length. The proposed status made by CUBC (Lightweight) suggested that they receive a Discretionary Full Blue status, when they had previously had to apply for Extraordinary Full Blues. The status proposed that all athletes who compete in the Varsity Match against Oxford and either medal at BUCS Regatta or qualify for the main draw of Henley Royal Regatta should receive Full Blues.

The MBC discussed the idea of having 2 opportunities in a season for athletes to win Full Blues. It was decided that the MBC only wanted to give the CUBC (Lightweight) athletes one opportunity to win a Full Blue, given this is the situation with many other sports.

Therefore, a debate ensued about whether the BUCS or Henley criteria should be used. The Hon. Sec suggested the MBC grant a status that meant the first 8 from CUBC (Lightweight) must achieve a top 10% finish in their BUCS equivalent to align this status with previous ones passed for other sports. However, other members of the MBC felt the Henley status was more prestigious and that the competition at the BUCS equivalent race was not consistent enough for the CUBC (Lightweight) Full Blue status to be based on this competition. Therefore, the MBC decided to debate how to use the Henley Royal Regatta as an opportunity for CUBC (Lightweight) athletes to win Full Blues.

There was a large debate about the round to which CUBC (Lightweight) athletes must reach within the Henley Royal Regatta in order to win a Full Blue. After a lengthy discussion from the members of the MBC, the MBC finally decided on a status for CUBC (Lightweight).

Therefore, the MBC was happy to ratify a new status for CUBC (Lightweight) as following:

A Full Blue is awarded to an athlete fulfilling the following criteria in the same season:

- 1. Competes in the Varsity Match against Oxford, AND one of the following:*
- 2. Qualifies and wins in the first round of the Temple Challenge Cup at the Henley Royal Regatta*
OR,
- 3. Qualifies and wins in the first round of the Prince Albert Challenge Cup at the Henley Royal Regatta.*

NB If an athlete is competing in both races, they must specify in a letter to the President of CUBC which race they are designating as their opportunity to win their Full Blue.

A Half Blue is awarded to an athlete fulfilling the following criteria in the same season:

- 1. Competes in the Varsity Match against Oxford.*

Hon. Sec to notify CUBC (Lightweight) of the outcome.

CU Automobile Club – CUaC

The MBC welcomed a status application from CU Automobile Club. The status change requested by CU Automobile Club included two updates to their current Discretionary Full Blue status.

Firstly, it was noted that CU Automobile Club wanted to remove finishing in the top 5 of an MSA British, British Open or English Championship (or equivalent in an athlete's home country) from their Full Blue status. It was suggested that it was replaced with a status that referred to gaining 15 places in the BUKC Main race and setting a top-5 fastest lap time in an individual BUKC Main race. Given the cost (roughly £5,000 individually) of entering a Championship race, the MBC felt it was important to change this aspect of the status as it is important athletes are not prevented from winning Full Blues due to financial cost. However, the MBC decided that it would be more appropriate to work towards consistency with other sports on this aspect of the status. The MBC discussed and agreed the idea that this part of the status should be updated to an athlete having to finish within a team that finishes within the top 10% of University A teams at the BUKC Championship (the equivalent of BUCS).

Secondly, it was noted that CU Automobile Club wanted to change the part of their Full Blue status that included winning the Varsity Race individually to one that allowed for more athletes to be considered for Full Blues. CU Automobile Club suggested in their application that if they had 2 outstanding athletes competing, then this part of their status would only allow for one to be awarded. The MBC were receptive to this, however felt that a stricter criterion was more appropriate than the one suggested. CU Automobile Club suggested that the top 3 Cambridge athletes be eligible for Full Blues in this part of their status. However, the MBC felt it more appropriate to reward the top 3 athletes in the Varsity Match as a whole. It was decided that if CU Automobile Club had 3 outstanding athletes, then achieving the top 3 spots at the VM would be fair for an athlete to be eligible for a Full Blue.

Therefore, the MBC was happy to ratify a new status for CU Automobile Club as following:

A Full Blue is awarded to an athlete fulfilling the following criteria in the same season:

- 1. Represent Cambridge University 1st Team at a minimum of 6 rounds of the BUKC Main Championship, AND*
- 2. Finishes in the top 3 athletes in the Varsity Match race, AND*
- 3. Wins a BUKC Main Championship individual race, AND*
- 4. Finishes within a team that finishes within the top 10% of University A teams at the BUKC Championship.*

A Half Blue is awarded to an athlete fulfilling the following criteria in the same season:

- 1. Represents Cambridge University 1st Team at a minimum of 6 rounds of the BUKC Main Championship, AND*
- 2. Gains points at the Varsity Match race.*

Hon. Sec to notify CU Automobile Club of the outcome.

Status Applications - Half Blues

CUKC – Korfball

The Hon. Sec presented the application made by CU Korfball and noted the uncertainty of the discussion at the last meeting. However, due to a mistake at the last meeting on behalf of the Hon. Sec, the current Half Blue status of CUKC was not noted.

Given the acknowledgement of this new information, it was felt that a representative was not needed to answer many of the questions the MBC had at the last meeting. Technical difficulties also meant there was an issue reaching out to the CUKC representative to join the online meeting. CUKC were applying for their men's status to be stricter than currently enjoyed, so that this matches with the current women's status.

The MBC saw no problem with this move to conformity.

Therefore, the MBC was happy to ratify a new status for CUKC as following:

A Full Blue is awarded to an athlete based on an Extraordinary Full Blue application to the committee. More information surrounding this can be found on the MBC website.

A Half Blue is awarded to an athlete (with a maximum of 4 awards) fulfilling the following criteria in the same season:

- 1. Competes in the Varsity 1st team match for a minimum of 5 minutes, AND*
- 2. Competes for CUKB in over 80% of fixtures, AND*
- 3. Competes in the 1st team qualifying for the BUCS National Championship (1st Tier)*

Hon. Sec to notify CUKC of the outcome.

Extraordinary Full Blue Applications

Tom Dendooven and Showgo Kimura – CUJC

The MBC welcomed 2 applications for Extraordinary Full Blues from CUJC. It was noted that both athletes, Tom Dendooven and Showgo Kimura, were competing at an impressive standard within their respective Judo competitions. Given the reason for the applications were that the two athletes in question had not fulfilled the Discretionary Full Blue criteria set out by the MBC in previous meetings, the applications were **rejected**.

The MBC noted that the reason for the Extraordinary Full Blue is to primarily award individuals who are outstanding at their sport Full Blues if their sport does not have a Discretionary status for them to achieve. The MBC debated for a while over whether the athletes had achieved enough outside of the status to justify the award of an Extraordinary Full Blue. It was noted that both athletes have impressive competition records.

However, the Discretionary status exists to reward those athletes who are at a certain level Full Blues. The MBC felt that CUJC should reapply to the MBC if they feel that outstanding athletes are not being given fair awards under the current status. The high national performance of Showgo Kimura was discussed in great depth. However, there are unfortunately no grounds to award Extraordinary Blues to individuals who are not meeting Discretionary Full Blue standards, with no valid reason for not meeting them. Not performing to a high enough standard at the required competition in a Discretionary status is unfortunately not a valid reason to apply for an Extraordinary Full Blue.

Hon. Sec to notify the athletes of the outcome and discuss CUJC's current status with the captain.

Dave Bell – CUCC

It was noted by the MBC that Dave Bell had applied for an Honorary Blue. Dave demonstrated to the committee that he had substantially passed the criteria required of a cyclist for a Full Blue. However, Dave was not able to compete in the Cycling Varsity match due to the COVID-19 pandemic. This prompted him

to apply to the MBC for an Honorary award, given competing and finishing within the top 6 of the Varsity Match was part of the criteria required of a cyclist for a Half Blue (and therefore Full Blue).

The MBC were impressed with Dave's achievements. It was felt that the evidence Dave provided gave the MBC great confidence that he would have won a Full Blue without any doubt had the COVID-19 pandemic not occurred.

It was then suggested that given his outstanding achievements, that Dave be awarded an Extraordinary Full Blue instead of an Honorary Full Blue. This was decided upon due to the fact that, not only had Dave surpassed the Blues standard for cycling, but was competing at an extraordinary level nationally and very comfortably achieving the times required of a Full Blue cyclist.

Therefore, the MBC were happy to award Dave Bell an Extraordinary Full Blue in Cycling.

Hon. Sec to notify Dave Bell of the outcome.

Honorary Full and Half Blue Applications

Half Blues

CUCrC – Sailing

The MBC welcomed an Honorary application for Honorary Half Blue awards from CUCrC.

The Half Blue status for CUCrC requires an athlete to compete in the Varsity Match AND compete as part of a team at the BUCS Team Racing Finals, with a maximum of 9 awards in a year.

The application demonstrated to the MBC that the athletes in question would have fulfilled the Half Blue criteria had the COVID-19 pandemic situation not occurred. This is because the only criteria the nominated athletes had not fulfilled included criteria that could have been met by just participation at certain events. All the athletes nominated in question had shown they had met the performance criteria (qualifying for the BUCS Team Racing Final) of the Half Blue status for CUCrC.

Therefore, the MBC were happy to award Honorary Half Blues to the following athletes from CUCrC:

1. Robbie King
2. Jamie Webb
3. Adam Rathmell
4. Milo Gill-Taylor
5. Ewan Gribbin
6. Callum Fanden
7. Freddie Scott
8. Oli Jagger
9. Hugh Tomkins

Hon. Sec to notify CUCrC of the outcome.

CUPLC – Powerlifting

The MBC welcomed an Honorary application for Honorary Half Blue awards from CUPLC.

The Half Blue status for CUPLC involves an athlete having to compete in a Varsity Match AND compete in another IPF affiliated competition AND achieve 540 IPF points at the Varsity Match or at an IPF affiliated competition.

The application demonstrated that all of the athletes had competed in the Varsity Match and achieved 540 IPF points. However, all athletes were unable to compete at another IPF affiliated competition due to the COVID-19 pandemic. Therefore, given the athletes in question only had to turn up and compete at the competitions they missed due to COVID-19 and had fulfilled the other Half Blue criteria, the MBC felt it appropriate to award the nominated athletes Honorary Half Blues.

Therefore, the MBC were happy to award Honorary Half Blues to the following athletes from CUPLC:

1. Sujan Sriharan
2. Akash Sengupta
3. Charlie Woodman
4. Stelios Sarantellis
5. Stefan Ivanov

Full Blues

CUMPC - Modern Pentathlon

The MBC discussed the Honorary Full Blue application submitted by CUMPC at length. Whilst the achievements of the athlete in question were noted, there was doubt over whether the athlete in question would have obtained the Full Blue standard had the COVID-19 pandemic not occurred. Therefore, the application was **rejected**.

The MBC noted that the individual athlete had technically performed to a level that met the Full Blue criteria. The athlete in question scored 4832 in the COVID-19 secure Varsity Match, with the Full Blue score requirement being set at 4800. However, the Varsity Match that this score was achieved in was of a notable difference to the normal Varsity Match normally played between CUMPC and Oxford. It was also noted that the same athlete had missed the opportunity to win a Full Blue earlier on in the season at a National Ranking event. Given the athlete had an opportunity within the normal season to fulfil the Full Blue criteria and did not due to performance, it was decided that there was doubt over whether the athlete would have achieved the Full Blues points requirement had the CUMPC Varsity Match been in a normal format. CUMPC are in a fortunate position where their athletes have more than one opportunity in a season to obtain their Full Blue criteria, which is not an opportunity many other sports have. This unfortunately led the MBC to reject the application.

Hon. Sec to notify CUMPC of the outcome.

CULTC – Lawn Tennis

An application was submitted to the MBC surrounding a unique situation where an athlete was unable to perform in a Varsity Match due to health and safety concerns about the current pandemic. From the application submitted to the MBC, the athlete would have certainly won a Full Blue had the COVID-19 pandemic not occurred. The CULTC captain noted that the athlete would have certainly played in the Varsity Match had the pandemic not occurred. Therefore, there is no doubt the athlete in question would have won a Full Blue had the pandemic not occurred.

Therefore, the MBC were happy to award the nominated athlete from CULTC with an Honorary Full Blue.

Hon. Sec to notify CULTC of the outcome.

CUSWPC – Swimming

The MBC discussed this application at length. The athlete in question had demonstrated a number of times throughout the season that he was very close to achieving the Full Blue time required of him (0.04 seconds). However, given the athlete had opportunities to achieve the time earlier on in the season and did not, the MBC decided that there was doubt surrounding whether the athlete in question would have achieved a Full Blue had the COVID-19 pandemic not occurred. Therefore, the application was **rejected**.

Hon. Sec to notify CUSWPC of the outcome.

CUAFC – Football

All individuals within the CUAFC Varsity Team are awarded Blues. Therefore, there was no doubt that the listed 11 individuals would have obtained Full Blues had the COVID-19 pandemic not occurred.

Therefore, the MBC were happy to award Honorary Full Blues to the following athletes from CUAFC:

1. Tim Wallace
2. Oduma Adelio
3. Lukas Mertes
4. Ellis Birch
5. Alex Landell-Mills
6. Nick Gallagher
7. Tomas Nevrkla
8. Angus Buttar
9. Ryan Hoffmann
10. Ethan Ratus
11. Nick Hope

Discretionary Full and Half Blue Awards

Half Blues

CU Judo Club

Peter Hampshire
Showgo Kimura
Harry Jones
Stelios Sarantellis-Komninellis
Dan Toy
Raphael Pangalangan
Tom Dendooven

CU Australian Rules Football Club

The CU Australian Rules Football Club nominated athletes for Discretionary Half Blue awards. However, none of the athletes fulfilled the criteria set out by the MBC previously. Therefore, the applications were **rejected**.

Hon. Sec to notify the relevant clubs of the outcomes.

Notification of Full and Half Blue awards to Individuals of Clubs with Full Blue Status

CULTC – Full Blues

Michal Kaminski
James Shemilt
Finn Ranson
James Darby
Jack Wilson-Smith
Pascal Gehlert
Domenic Pilger

CUCC – Full Blues

Alex Agedah
Niel Botha
Pieter Daneel
Jovan Dhariwal
Padraic Flangan
James Gillespie

Reports of meetings with CUWBC, USC, JBCOCU

The Hon. Sec presented the most recent discussions of the JBCOCU surrounding transgender athlete eligibility to the MBC. The Hon. Sec made the committee aware of the new guidelines as to what to do should an issue surrounding this occur. The Hon. Sec also took the opportunity to remind the MBC that any issues surrounding eligibility of athletes for Varsity Matches should be directed towards himself.

Any Other Business

On the theme of increasing the work the MBC is doing to increase its transparency, the Hon. Sec presented some ideas to the committee to continue this drive. These included notices and a QR code to the website being displayed at the Hawks Club and improving the access of the website further.

Hon. Sec to contact Hawks' President surrounding this move.

With no other business to discuss, the meeting closed at 2142.

FOR APPROVAL